



Important note: *To be completed with reference to the Reporting Guidance Notes for Project Leaders: it is expected that this report will be about 10 pages in length, excluding annexes*

Submission Deadline: 30th April 2017

IWT Challenge Fund Project Information

Project reference	IWT 015
Project title	A recipe for reducing ivory consumption in China
Country/ies	China
Contract holder Institution	Wildlife Conservation Society
Partner institution(s)	Beijing Normal University, China Wildlife Conservation Association
IWT grant value	238,891
Start/end dates of project	15 th April 2015 / 15 th September 2017
Reporting period (e.g. April 2016-Mar 2017) and number (e.g. Annual Report 1,2,3)	April 2016– March 2017, Annual Report 2
Project leader name	Aili Kang
Project website	
Report author(s) and date	

1. Project rationale

Poaching of elephants, which leads to dramatic declines in many elephant populations, has been driven by demand for ivory products in Asia, particularly China. Demand for ivory in China is fueled by the perception of prestige associated with owning ivory products. As a “precious” and rare commodity, ivory has become desirable to an increasing number of upper-middle class consumers.

Evidence suggests that regardless of a high awareness that ivory comes from elephants illegally killed for their tusks, 84% of ivory purchasers still intend to buy more ivory products in the future (National Geographic 2012). However, consumers are willing to stop buying ivory if it became illegal or more difficult to purchase (IFAW 2011, WildAid 2012). This offered the entry point WCS exploited with the support from this IWT grant.

The overarching goal of this project was to reduce the demand for ivory from the Chinese public. The project was designed to achieve this through three concurrent approaches:

- a) engage the Chinese public, in particular those segments of the society more prone to consume ivory products, and sensitize them towards the elephant crisis and the wildlife trade legislation;
- b) engage the corporate sector to promote an ivory-free business culture;
- c) engage the Chinese government to act by outlawing the domestic trade in ivory and effectively enforce the legislation on wildlife trade.

The project team promoted online and ground campaigns addressing targeted population groups across popular social media platforms, traditional media reports, prime-time TV channel shows, and international transportation hubs across China in order to spur behavioural change and action among influential businesses and citizen groups.

The project team also established a think-tank working closely with Chinese central government partners to advocate for a strengthened policy response. This coordinated effort – which involved a larger group of organizations under the SNAP Partnership – providing advice to policy makers to ban the domestic ivory trade as announced on December 31, 2017.

After this major positive shift in the Chinese government domestic trade policy and the experience the Project Team accrued so far, WCS refocused its demand reduction activities towards the role of Chinese expatriates in Africa as local consumers of ivory and occasional small scale traders to China. This new theory of change is detailed in section 13.

2. Project partnerships

Beijing Normal University (BNU) was the principal partner in the economic study of the ivory trade, incorporated into Output 3 of this project. BNU cooperate with WCS in the designing and implementing a research to provide the best advice, based on clear evidence, expert consultations and scenario modeling, on the scope and timing of the implementation of China's newly announced changes to its ivory trade policy. As a result of this collaboration, BNU and WCS have expanded our institutional collaboration to a Working Group comprised of national and international experts with backgrounds in trade, economics, ecology, ivory markets and strong links to key legislators in deploying the research and outreach the results of it.

The China Wildlife Conservation Associated (CWCA) is a Chinese government-backed non-governmental organization hosted by the State Forestry Administration, with over 30 years of experience in education and sensitization campaigns in China and featuring an extensive network of 773 local branches and over 3,450,000 members and supporters. WCS and CWCA have collaborated on multiple aspects of wildlife conservation in China across the years, including law enforcement capacity building and intelligence gathering in South China. As the largest local conservation NGO of China with strong government trusts, CWCA has been a strategic partner for ensuring a successful implementation of this project, and contributed extensively in designing and delivering targeted offline behavioural change and awareness raising campaigns in Beijing and Guangxi provinces. CWCA is also actively promoting policy recommendation produced within this project.

Science for Nature and People Partnership (SNAPP): Launched in 2013, as a partnership among The Nature Conservancy, the Wildlife Conservation Society, and the National Center for Ecological Analysis and Synthesis (NCEAS) at University of California, SNAPP is a first-of-its-kind collaboration that delivers evidence-based, scalable solutions to global challenges at the intersection of nature conservation, sustainable development, and human well-being. Complementing Output 3 of this IWT project, SNAPP provides both financial and technical support for WCS cooperating with BNU in “Economics of the Chinese Ivory Trade Project”, bringing together Chinese and international experts in Working Group to answer key questions and make policy recommendations to provide an evidence base that (1) helps the Chinese authorities select the most effective policies on the ivory trade in China and (2) provides advice on how best to implement those policies.

The China CITES Management Authority office (CITES MA) oversees CITES implementation in the country and are key government partners for this project. WCS

coordinated and communicated all aspects of this work and its results with them to ensure the actions are communicated back to the CITES policy makers in China. In the behavior change campaigns themed of crime prevention, e.g. VOC for Chinese travelers at international ports, CITES MA has been our partner in facilitating the cooperation with other government agencies the promotion of our demand reduction campaigns.

State Forestry Administrative (SFA) is responsible for the conservation of all terrestrial wildlife and for enforcing law in case of wildlife crimes. WCS China operates under a Memorandum of Understanding with SFA, which outlines our strategic cooperation for strengthening the legislation framework, enhancing the capacity of law enforcement agencies in the country, and reducing demand for endangered species. Our long term cooperation ensures activities of this IWT project fit under an umbrella securing the legal status of WCS cooperation with the China government.

Raffles Academy – an education institute - helped with graphic design for WCS campaigns and events under this IWT project. The project team has also invited the fashion designers of the school to produce “Consume No Ivory” statements and plan to promote on social media and fashion websites.

Partnering with the Lighthouse Academy – another education institution preparing students for college – WCS initiated an intern program which engaged their student clients with elephant conservation by supporting the preparation of ivory related media reports and designing contents for social media communication.

3. Project progress

3.1. Progress in carrying out project Activities

Expand social media and traditional media coverage on ivory and elephants through the Wildlife Conservation Media Incubator, a social-media-based network that will provide technical, logistic, and editorial support to journalists covering diverse topics that influence ivory consumption (e.g. fashion, religion, travel).

A major policy shift was announced on Dec 30, 2016: The General Office of the State Council of the People's Republic of China declared the intention to stop all commercial sales and crafting of ivory products in China by the end of 2017. Such government pledges against ivory were identified as a key motivation for consumers to stop buying ivory in previous consumer study (see supporting materials of “IWT M&E Review” for the reference) and thus we focused our media engagement around this message including the following activities:

- The Project Team found out that the online ivory market will need to be specifically addressed by the ivory ban implementation policy in order to prevent possible loopholes. To prepare the public on the potential ivory trade ban announcement, one month before the enacting of the ban WCS pitched a China News Weekly reporter to discuss this problem, and this resulted in the first in-depth report published in China specifically focused on ivory online trade published in both English and Chinese languages and based on the findings from a research led by WCS (see Output 3 activity for details),
- To promote the China domestic ivory ban, the project team promoted 3 in-depth news reports on top media platforms including China Daily and The Paper discussing two hot issues: announcement of the US Ivory ban, and advancements in the US-China Strategic and Economic Dialogue. These reports had generated an exposure to 2,300,000 audience.
- To echo this major step of the Chinese government, on the day the ban was announced, Dr. Zhangli, researcher and collaborator in our ivory policy study, was interviewed by China 24, a CCTV English Channel. He elaborated on the WCS research findings and further promoted the legal process and the next management steps of the ivory ban. On the second day of the ban, WCS has supported China Daily to discuss how should government deal with legal ivory stockpiles after the ban.
- The Project Team reached out to the popular comedian Li Ding providing technical advice and scientific evidence about the elephant crisis in support to his performance “Walk with

the Beast". During this performance, Li Ding and his comedian partner portrayed the whole trade chain and explained why the demand for ivory is a driver for elephant poaching. At the end of the sketch, the two comedians pledged "To protect endangered wildlife, we promise to stop buying their products". The performance was aired on August 3, 2016 as part of the larger "I'm Mad about Comedy" prime-time show on Hubei Satellite TV, with an estimated audience of over 8,880,000 people. The form of Chinese comedy "Xiang Sheng" featured in the show is now popular among young audiences fond of Chinese traditions. Such social segment has emerged as potential ivory consumer according to the criteria of "young" and "collector of traditional decoration items" from the project's monitoring reports (see supporting materials of "IWT M&E Review" and the CIC report 2013).

Design innovative interactive social media campaigns (e.g. Voices of China) which are tailored for use through portable devices and promote and capture direct public commitment "not to bring ivory home" (a key message "branded" with Voices of China and used across all campaigns).

The project team collaborated with Huangpu port (the busiest port of Guangdong between mainland China and Hongkong) in January 2017 and launched "Stand for Elephant, Drive/Bring no Ivory home" as part of the Voice Of China (VOC) campaign series at cargo inspection gateways and railway stations, promoting law and Ivory ban amongst a target audience (shipping industry/cargo drivers and travelers) who play a crucial role along the illegal wildlife trade chain. The Project Team worked with eight shipping and transportation companies, including the Hong Yuan Group, an influential corporation in Guangdong Province. The campaign aimed at encouraging companies to obey the law and pledge not to transfer or consume ivory. Within one month, 26 cargo ships and trucks with "Stand for Elephant, Drive No Ivory Home" stickers, have traveled between Dongguan, Shenzhen, Hong Kong, and Macao, exposing the message along approximately 2800 miles each day. Resulting from the successful WCS campaign was the first ever "Declaration of Self-discipline Against Transportation of Illegal Wildlife and Product", which was publicized across traditional and social media platforms.

The VOC campaign also took place at Changping Railway station, a Huangpu Custom port, where travelers commute mainly between Hong Kong and Guangdong Province. Over this two-day campaign, the team secured about 130 pledges of travelers, promising to "bring no Ivory home"; and at least 50,000 travelers have been exposed to the posters by the end of February, 2017. Through this campaign, the project has also supported 6 media reports appeared on influential newspapers and media platforms, and additional 17 reposts that have been put on governmental news platforms such as Xinhua.net, people.om.cn, Sina.com, and Netease. So far, our conservative estimate shows a total exposure of these news surpassing 6 million people for printed media, and 500,000 for online media.

The project team also expanded our work by cooperating with NGOs to amplify the campaign efforts to broader audience groups for gaining public engagement in condemning ivory consumption. The team has made partnership with the Jane Goodall Institute China - Roots & Shoots Beijing Office and displayed "Guardians of Elephant" posters in the Beijing Zoo, which enjoys over 4,000,000 visitors annually. The team also involved in the related college students program, which reached to over 60,000 students. Three campaign proposals regarding travelers and workers in Africa have been selected and will be implemented next year. Furthermore, WCS, together with other NGOs, partnered with CWCA and the Beijing Zoo on the fourth World Wildlife Day to produce a public exhibition to educate tourists and children against ivory consumption. This was advertised in situ as well as on social media platforms.

Coordinate with private sector entities to publicize their statements to stop ivory consumption through social media and traditional media in order to reach a broad audience.

WCS co-organized a "Challenges and Opportunities - Chinese Enterprises Engagement in Wildlife Conservation in Africa" workshop in March 2017, an event specifically aiming at

Chinese State Own Enterprise operating in Africa to engage more in wildlife conservation. The project team successfully promoted the ivory trade pledging message through this activity to mass media and the public, generating 6 original media reports appeared on 25 media platforms including central government media, video& TV, magazine and newspaper. A conservative estimate shows that this news has reached approximately 500,000 people. WCS believes that messages from influential companies in business sectors will have impacts on the public's perception of elephant conservation and ivory consumption.

WCS, partnered with CWCA and the CSR consultancy company SynTao, hosted the workshop and invited over 80 representatives from Chinese companies, embassies of African countries as well as Britain and United States, international NGOs, and medias specialized in China's foreign policy and business investment. Representatives from 15 companies – of which 15 State owned Enterprises - which maintain significant business activities in Africa joined the discussion on how tailored business investments and sensible operation in Africa can minimize the impact on local wildlife and actually support local environmental conservation.

The project team presented a review of ivory trade and other significant wildlife crime connecting Chinese travelers to Africa. WCS also introduced best practices in CSR implemented in Africa, and the audience engaged into an extensive discussion on how to extend such experiences to wildlife conservation. General consensus was reached on the need for addressing wildlife conservation challenges in Africa. This event allowed also to promote a greater awareness of WCS expertise, experience, and proven approaches in developing science-based solutions to challenges in wildlife conservation.

During the reporting period, the team expanded our partnership with a series of Chinese companies and institutes serving business development to support reducing ivory consumption in China. A list of major cooperation achievements during the past 12 months follows:

- SynTao is a CSR consultancy (http://www.syntao.com/index_EN.asp) mainly serving state owned enterprises in Africa and Asia. They offer consultancy services about overseas investments to 50 Chinese companies and one Kenya and China Economic Association whose membership consists of 60 state owned enterprises in Africa.

SynTao cooperated with the WCS project team willing to share best practices from our project among its network and encourage companies to engage in supporting demand reduction and ivory crime prevention in their operations. Training courses for those companies, “no ivory consumption” materials for staff orientation package, and performance guidelines will be delivered through the channel offered by SynTao to scale up the impact among Chinese companies and Chinese employees in Africa. This cooperation will be further fitting into the WCS new theory of change for demand reduction on ivory and other endangered species, which evolves from the current IWT project.

- Poly Technologies, who has been involved in previous public commitment, is willing to work on further behavioural change campaigns among their employees. WCS is working with Poly to develop “no ivory consumption” publicity materials for their staff orientation package and for their staff performance guidelines. We will develop a questionnaire to track behavioural change before and after those campaigns through the CSR department of Poly. Poly is one of the biggest companies investing in Africa and with 3,000 Chinese staff traveling to Africa each year. Through this effort, we can demonstrate how big companies can be involved in direct behaviour change work among Poly's network.

Engage top corporations and strategic industries in the design and implementation of behavioral change campaigns to make ivory undesirable.

Partnering with online security department of Tencent, the largest social media company in China, and Doodao, a social listening company, to co-launch ivory consumption survey online. The survey has been promoted through social media, attracting more than 1,200 netizens to fill in survey, which has helped build baseline for stopping ivory consumption.

Coordinate influential partners to present justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market to government ministries and political advisory bodies based on 1) the economic drivers and costs of the current model of limited legal trade in China; 2) the overall impact on people who work in ivory trade; 3) the potential impact on China's global image; 4) overall cost-benefit ratio of the ivory trade for local livelihoods, ecosystems, and other issues of human security in key African elephant range states where poaching occurs; and 5) opportunities for more sustainable Chinese investment in Africa.

Recognizing the size and nature of this objective, WCS worked closely within a Science for Nature and People Partnership (SNAPP) working group to promote a revised ivory policy. The Working Group comprised of national and international experts with backgrounds in trade, economics, ecology, ivory markets and strong links to key legislators was established to guide research and provide oversight of this SNAPP project. During the project period, a third Working Group meeting was held with the direct financial support from this IWT project, to bring together experts towards finalizing the study results.

By this project period, significant progress was made with a number of deliverables accomplished, including (Please find a SNAPP bi-annual report for detailed description of following activities progress during the report period attached in supporting materials):

- publishing the results from the risk assessments on different timeline scenarios for China's ivory ban and their impact on speculation, and communicating them in important international conventions, and to influential political figures and policy makers
- finalizing a draft of paper on legislative assessment of the legality of the proposed ivory trade ban
- communicated an assessment of the cost and effectiveness of enforcing the ban,
- analysis of the public perception about the proposed ivory ban, and
- a study investigating how the China ivory trade may affect African elephants range states.

The working group also lead a holistic desk review on the impact of China ivory trade on African elephant range states, including the political, economic, and local community livelihood perspectives.

3.2. Progress towards project Outputs

Output 1 - A greater number of Chinese consumers perceive ivory to be an undesirable product and engage in anti-ivory campaigns to support government action.

Popularity of elephant conservation on Weibo (Indicator 1.1)

During the report period, online discussions on the Weibo microblogging platform favourable to elephant conservation and rejecting ivory consumption ranked 3rd out of all 23 animal protection topics, second only to cats and dogs, which is a notable increase up from the baseline of 9th place recorded in 2013(CIC & WCS, 2013; Doodao & WCS, in review). This increase is in line with the increased number of original Weibo posts on topic of elephant conservation on social media pages, which almost tripled from 668 in 2013 to 1,764 in 2016, generating the total 147% increase of online interaction (likes, comments and re-tweets) on Weibo from 617,721 in 2013 to 910,995 in 2016.

Among those original posts, the amount directly generated by WCS (166 posts) ranked 1st among all NGOs in 2016, followed by WildAid and IFAW. WCS further leveraged social media and traditional media's social media platform in our online campaigns and communication activities (e.g. supporting in-depth reports or featured articles) supported or made possible by this Project, and generated 359 original posts in total, contributing to 20% of the total buzz increase during the project period, with as much as 80% of the increase attributable to organic growth. Multiple organizations have advocated elephant conservation in the country during the project period. WCS footprint can be tracked through the hash-tag "Don't bring ivory home" (不把象牙带回家) which the project team promoted in multiple occasions. This activity generated 125,050 interactions and an overall exposure of 9,166,859 visualizations.

□ **No. articles about elephant conservation disseminated (Indicator 1.2)**

The project team extracted from the international press the most compelling feature articles on these topics and posted their translation in Chinese language on the social media pages managed by WCS. The number of stories posted exceeded 60 during year one of the project period – as previously reported – and counted 203 articles total in this reporting period,

□ **No. feature reports about the elephant crisis in Chinese language (Indicator 1.3)**

During the project period, WCS established a close collaboration with 20 traditional media outlets in order to promote the development of homegrown Chinese feature stories covering elephant conservation. By the report period end, 26 feature reports were published on 22 popular and authoritative newspapers and magazines such as Cai Xin, China Daily, China Dialogue, CRI, Ifeng, the New York Times, Phoenix Weekly, Southern Weekly, and XinHua, exceeding. The majority of these articles appeared on the Chinese language versions of these media outlets, and reached an audience of over 7,000,000 people, generating over 3,377 interactions.

□ **No. Chinese citizens exposed to elephant conservation messages (Indicator 1.4)**

WCS tracked the total number of online views and interactions generated by WCS-created online content funded through this grant. By the report period end, WCS had counted over 319,734,993 exposures to people via a variety of means, including online social media, websites, ground activities and traditional media.

□ **No. online interactions among Chinese citizens on elephant conservation (Indicator 1.5)**

A total of 153,755 engagements were recorded, which include likes, forwards, and offline interactions. It shall be noted that this is a very conservative figure given the difficulty in recording engagement in the case of TV programs, posters, and printed media articles.

□ **Ivory price reduction (Indicator 1.6)**

WCS monitoring of major ivory markets indicated that the price has been decreasing. Since November 2015, WCS performed a monthly monitoring of the legal ivory markets in Guangzhou City of Guangdong Province, and illegal trade through social media, to detect the market response to policy change. Three indicators have been monitored: percentage of discount and the length of discount period; price of less worked items and the ratio of ivory items to total items exhibited in the legal store.

As the government rolls out the closing of the market with a series of announcements made by political leaders since 2015, along with increasing efforts in other activities of demand reduction social marketing conducted by the conservation community in China, WCS is observing positive results consistently with the report issued by Save the Elephants in March 2017. A broad range of price with median at \$/kg in March 2017 for less-worked products, while it was \$/kg in late spring of 2016. We think the median price is better than average price to present the market status due to variance in negotiating skills, quality of the carving, and ivory among different sites.

Due to the existence of illegal trade, this data may not cover the full picture. WCS has focused on the market in Guangzhou City in Guangdong Province due to its role of wildlife trade hub in China. Guangzhou has the largest consumption market for wildlife as both food and traditional medicine; it is a traditional center of ivory carving (along with Beijing, Shanghai); and it is the busiest port in the south of China to connect the world, with frequent direct flights to Africa and Southeast Asia.

Legal shops have showed different strategies in response to the policy and public awareness change but since August 2016 around half of the legal shops surveyed have offered various discounted prices. Shops keepers visited early 2017 commented that it was the best time to buy ivory as the government is shutting them down.

We believe that the ivory ban as well as behavior changing campaigns engaging wider population in China have played a significant role in de-valuing ivory. We also believe that such social shift has in turn depressed consumption for investment purposes and increased motivation for enforcement agencies to enhance actions on illegal ivory trade.

□ **Reduction of posts trading in ivory on the Weibo platform (Indicator 1.7)**

WCS commissioned consumer research that analyzed over 1,000,000 tweets from the Weibo social media platform, which allowed for a close comparison with an earlier study performed in 2013. Findings resulting from this research showed that the most common ivory products are still bracelets and pendants, which are still sought after by fashionable and superstitious consumers, often of Buddhist belief. During the past three years, the gender ratio of probable ivory consumers became balanced, with a proportional increase in male buyers. Age segmentation shows a sizable increase (around +33%) of probable consumers born in the 1990s, now representing 40% of the total, a similar percentage of those born in the 1980s. This trend could be explained by younger citizens in their early twenties starting to have a disposable income.

Through this consumer research and online data mining report, WCS was able to assess a 37% reduction in the number of tweets related to trading in ivory on the Weibo social media platform, and 70% reduction in the number of accounts tweeting to display ivory consumption, exceeding the 20% reduction committed at project start. We expect the cause to be the increasing exposure of elephant conservation on this open platform, which has induced traders to shift to a more discreet medium such as the private chats of the increasingly popular WeChat application. Unlike Weibo microblogging, this platform provides the added benefit of enabling direct money transactions as well as offering e-commerce features. Due to the nature and complexity of the phenomenon, WCS cannot attribute this reduction in the size of tweets trading in ivory on Weibo to specific activities funded under this grant. However, we are confident that our activities along with campaigns lead by other organizations have contributed to this result.

WCS distributed questionnaires widely among our target audience, and performed in-depth face to face and focus group interviews to better define ivory consumers demand and behaviour. This data instructed our behavioural change campaign strategy and activities, and allowed us to perform an evidence-based impact evaluation

Output 2: Influential Chinese companies are engaged and mobilized to take action to reduce ivory consumption

No. companies publicly pledging not to bring ivory home (Indicator 2.1)

WCS has secured the agreement of 44 Chinese companies to make public pledges in support to elephant conservation and against illegal wildlife trafficking, and to develop a zero tolerance policy on illegal wildlife trade for staff. Companies were from the logistic transportation industry, tourism sector, and Chinese state owned enterprises operating in Africa. We have concentrated efforts on a smaller number of high-profile and highly relevant companies such as AVIC, and Poly Group which have around 400,000 and 60,000 employees respectively worldwide, and hold an large share of manpower in African countries affected by the elephant crisis. WCS continues to work with these companies, including with their African subsidiaries, to embed conservation messages in their staff orientation package and include them in staff performance guidelines.

The symposium on Chinese Enterprises Engagement in Wildlife Conservation in Africa held in Beijing saw the participation of 15 companies, including 11 large state-owned enterprises with extensive presence in East Africa (e.g. CNPC and Poly Group). Over 80 attendees joined, including high-level representatives from the China, Uganda, UK and US governments, the corporate sector, and local and international media outlets (XinHua, CCTV, CRI, etc.).

No. private sector sponsorships (Indicator 2.2)

As part of WCS private sector strategy, we have engaged companies to actively participate and contribute to our conservation activities. During the project period, our team secured sponsorships from 13 companies, ranging from pro-bono advertising space and design services to more articulated campaign partnerships. This allowed us to secure over 330,000 USD in advertisement space value, a conservative figure excluding the value of the design services we also secured. Our ground activities engaged 7 international airports and seaports in addition to over 150 local transportation sites throughout the country. From these activities alone we have recorded at least 149,374 interactions.

Following the recommendations from the Fund, the project team redefined Indicator 2.2 (number of private sector sponsorships) towards a greater significance and impact-oriented basis. We believe that the figures above enable a more thorough measuring of our impact, rather than the total number of private sector sponsorships, which alone give no clue about the value and impact of such engagements.

No. corporate people exposed to elephant conservation messages (Indicator 2.3)

The project team has established an important collaboration with the SynTao consultancy, who offers overseas investments consultancy services to over 50 Chinese companies and the 'Kenya and China Economic Association' whose membership consists in over 60 Chinese state-owned enterprises in Africa. This partnership allows WCS to reach out and involve in conservation actions an extensive network of companies. Overall, our corporate engagement and on the ground publicity campaigns totaled over 28,400,000 exposures, more than doubling the number committed for indicator 2.3.

Output 3: Economic, social and political justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market are provided to government agencies through influential channels and networks

No. research papers published (Indicator 3.1)

During this reporting period, two of the studies carried out under this output have been published, with other four undergoing the final rounds of revisions by the project partners at the time of writing. Findings from all these studies have been distributed through influential channels and networks targeting Chinese policy makers.

No. of proposals submitted to government bodies (Indicator 3.2)

WCS submitted two proposals to expedite a ban on domestic ivory market with a specific timeline and without any duration limit to two top legislation and policy making political bodies: the National People's Congress (NPC) and the China People's Political Consultancy Committee (CPPCC). In April 2016, WCS followed up with the congressman and CPPCC member to which these two proposals had been submitted. According to the procedure, relevant departments of administrative office will receive these proposals as recommendations references from the NPC and CPPCC.

No. government agencies engaged (Indicator 3.3)

In order to achieve the deliverables listed above, the project team was able to establish a strong cooperation with government representatives of the National People's Congress, the China People's Political Consultancy Committee, the Central State Forestry Administration, the China CITES Management Authority, CWCA, the Customs Central Administration, the Endangered Species Import & Export Management Office, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Ministry of Commerce, in addition to a larger number of provincial and local level government entities.

3.3. Progress towards the project Outcome

Recognizing that the original set of progress indicators to measure advancement towards the Outcome may have some shortcomings – as also pointed out in the IWT report review

– the project team revised or adopt indirect method for estimating related key performance indicators as detailed at the end of this section. Meanwhile, we also feel compelled at reporting our achievements through the original set of indicators given they were vetted positively by IWT at the time of the project submission and approval.

The intention to purchase ivory appears to be reducing

The project team surveyed their intention to purchase ivory to compare to the 2012 National Geography report “Ivory Road Study”, that indicated 84% of interviewed ivory consumers intended to buy ivory in future. WCS repeated a similar online consumer survey in December 2016, and detected significant reduction in the share of ivory consumer intention. The online survey, with a sample size of 327 confirmed ivory consumers located in tier one cities, and indicated that 36.4% of the surveyed ivory consumers stated no intention to purchase ivory anymore. Also, almost 91% of the respondents agreed with the ivory market ban. This result suggested a reduction of about 48% in ivory consumer’s intention compared to the 2012 survey. There are several caveats to consider in these results. Firstly, the baseline predated the project start by three years, and secondly, we cannot attribute this decline to only our efforts.

Sales of ivory in domestic online auctions has significantly decreased

To demonstrate an effective reduction in the demand for legal ivory, WCS designed Outcome Indicator 2, which measured the trend in ivory sales in domestic auctions. The baseline of ivory items auctioned legally in China is 47 in 2014 (based on the report “Analysis Report of Ivory Carving Auction Market”). The Ivory Ban announcement from the General Office of the State Council of the People’s Republic of China has stressed the country will stop all its legal commercial sales – physical and online -- of elephant ivory in 2017. Due to the fund limitation, we are not able to contract Artron for a repeated monitoring of auction market as we did in 2014. However, Artron shared with us the data mining method and access to an open database on their platform. The project team was able to adapted Artron’s method for a quick monitoring of auction listing information published online. The search results suggested that after the ban implemented, the number of ivory items sold in legal domestic auctions market was zero by the end of March 2017. The major auction season will start in May, and we will conduct this monitoring again to confirm the detection of this outcome indicator before the end of the project. In interpreting these numbers two caveats shall be noted: a) the legal sales in ivory experienced considerable inter-quarter variations over the project period due to the effect of government announcements about the forthcoming trade ban; b) we could not track the attitudes of auction buyers and sellers towards the ivory ban, and therefore assess to what extent transaction variations were related to complementary trends in the underground illegal ivory market. Nonetheless, this indicator is useful to track the impact of the ivory ban announcement on consumers and investors behaviours ahead of the ivory trade ban. WCS implemented a whole set of activities specifically targeting auction houses and well-recognized traditional art investors, which were solely possible thanks to this IWT grant.

Measuring catch per unit effort of Chinese travelers bringing ivory home is challenging

WCS attempted to track the number of individuals caught bringing ivory from Africa, aiming at a 50% reduction by 2017 from 2014 levels. This process revealed to be extremely challenging for the project team. WCS found out that the China Customs do not record seizures consistently in a central database and do not release news of all seizures to the media. Leveraging from the close connections the project team has developed with the China Customs Department, a suggestion to maintain a central database was shared with our focal points, but its implementation was not possible within the relatively short timeframe of this project.

Leveraging on the long term cooperation between WCS China and local Customs in Guangzhou, Beijing and Shanghai, three largest international ports of China, the Project Team was able to reach out to our contact points about their estimation of the number of individuals caught with ivory at these three entry ports. Shanghai and Guangzhou Customs were able to give us sufficient information for evaluating this indicator. Shanghai Customs suggested in the past 5 years the total number of individuals caught with endangered species products declined by 80% and indicated that most of which are ivory items. Guangzhou Customs indicated a

significant drop in individuals caught with ivory, and they could only reveal the number of that in 2016 is 70. The team will further communicate with Guangzhou Customs to apply for the baseline data in 2014 and 2015. It shall be noted that a decrease in seizures can well represent both a decrease in the trade as well as a decrease in the enforcement of this illegal trade due to shifting priorities or variability in the capacity of the bag checking teams.

Over 8 million people exposed to WCS-led campaigns and more than 150,000 people interacting with WCS-led events supported by IWT during the past year.

Over 8 million people were exposed to WCS-led campaigns and events during the past year of report period. The project team designed a number of viral initiatives sensitizing the public over the elephant crisis driven by the illegal ivory trade both online and on the ground. From a baseline of 13,500 interactions recorded in 2014, WCS was able to exceed the projected tenfold increase totally over 153,755 interactions to our ivory demand reduction campaigns. It shall be noted that this is based exclusively on documented figures, and is therefore a very conservative number given that in multiple occasions we were not able to collect interaction levels due to the nature of the activity (e.g. TV shows, street posters, etc.). We can assume with some level of confidence that the actual total number of interactions generated by our campaigns is over 6 million given the number of exposures recorded (319,735,073) and a conservative 2% engagement rate. The project team is aware that these numbers albeit impressive might be more closely related to specific segments of the Chinese civil society already sensitive towards conservation issues. Nonetheless, building a larger consensus among the general population around the complete ivory trade ban we advocated was instrumental to induce a higher prioritization of the ivory ban policy proposal from the Chinese government, which was successfully achieved by the project team as demonstrated in the following paragraphs.

This evidence is additionally backed by a meta-analysis of 17 media reports, through which the project team was able to identify a sizable share of Chinese citizens supportive of the domestic ivory ban (25.7%), and an even larger share (48.6%) with a neutral opinion, supposedly made of consumers neither interested in ivory nor in elephant conservation. Interestingly, several reports expressing a negative attitude towards this policy change questioned the capacity of the Chinese government to enforce the ban and considered the one-year transition period a severe threat for the African elephant. Because the background of the reports authors is unknown, we cannot exclude those reports originating from conservation advocates, thus not representing the views of all the stakeholders.

The Chinese government has ramped up public statements to reduce ivory trade

During this project, period nine government announcements have been made regarding further restricting the domestic ivory trade in China and five government announcements or statements were made regarding the ban on ivory imports and export as well as ivory hunting trophy imports. From the 2014 baseline of 2 statements, after project start the Chinese government has increased its engagement in elephant conservation and delivered 5 public statements in 2015, 3 statements in 2016, including the announcement of the time-line for phasing out the domestic trade in ivory on December 31, 2016, and 1 statement for implementing the ban in 2017.

The decision from the Chinese government to phase out the domestic ivory trade is a massive achievement for conservation and WCS believes that our efforts have contributed to this; with our policy recommendations submitted to the National People's Congress and the China People's Political Consultancy Committee who over saw the details of the ban. Because of the relatively opaque policy drafting process from the perspective of external observers, and the involvement of multiple organizations within the SNAP Partnership, we are not in the position to attribute this decision solely to the actions made possible thanks to this IWT grant. This major achievement was made possible thanks a to a concerted effort involving multiple actors, wherein IWT played an important role by enabling WCS to participate and contribute our experience in this sector towards this objective. Without the funds from IWT, WCS wouldn't have had the resources to engage effectively with the government and other stakeholders.

On the basis of these findings and the successful adoption of the national ivory trade ban policy, WCS has evolved our theory of change for African elephant conservation. Our new strategy focuses on Chinese citizens directly purchasing ivory from African countries, either as part of their business practices or tourism experience. More on this is reported in Section 13.

3.4. Monitoring of assumptions

WCS has continued exercising a close monitoring of both Outcome and Output assumptions throughout the project.

Outcome Assumption 1 (Government action is the most effective way to reduce ivory consumption) was based on a December 2012 consumer survey report from the National Geographic (the “Ivory Road Study”). WCS has commissioned two follow-up consumer surveys and monitoring reports in the aftermath of the Chinese government announcement of the forthcoming trade ban in May 2015 and the actual release of the ban schedule in December 2016. Based on the resulting data we can confirm this assumption has proven true so far.

Outcome Assumption 2 (The Chinese government is committed to combating the illegal wildlife trade)

Over the project period, the Chinese government has issued 9 consistent statements supporting a stronger conservation of the African elephant and restricting the domestic trade. For example, the decision to hold a public ivory crush in January 2015, the announcement of the forthcoming domestic trade ban in May 2015, and of the ban implementation time-line on December 31, 2016, are some of the milestones proving our Outcome Assumption 2 correct. Data collected by the project team offers mixed evidence with regards to the effectiveness of social media campaigns versus traditional PSA approaches (*Outcome Assumption 3: Anti-ivory campaigns that mobilize citizens directly through interactive social media tools can achieve greater impact on consumer behavior than traditional Public Service Announcements approaches*). In general, the literature (e.g. (1) cited in the Year 1 Report) is consistent in indicating a lower impact of PSA-style approaches with a rate of efficacy around 5% of viewers. To be able to compare activities different in nature and execution, a special caution is necessary, including the precise definition of what is to be considered “effective” and the methodology adopted for measuring the impact. Mindful of these caveats, the Project Team measured an engagement rate of 1.36% resulting from the online campaign “Don’t bring ivory home” (measured as total exposure divided by total number of interactions). Conversely, WCS on the ground activities reported an engagement rate of 0.52%. This value, almost one third of the recorded online engagement, can support the assumption of the lower impact of PSA campaigns.

(1) <http://www.learningace.com/doc/1648360/0c951c8e031ecccddef0a8f83e26afd7b/impact-of-public-service-advertising-research-evidence-and-effective-strategies>

Output assumptions

Output Assumption 1: Chinese consumer behaviour can be influenced by other consumer, media, companies and the government

Marketing research into the largest global consumer market indicates these considerations remain relevant https://www.mckinsey.de/sites/mck_files/files/the-modernization-of-the-chinese-consumer.pdf. The online consumer survey conducted by WCS in December 2016 also indicated that the top 3 reasons for previous ivory consumers stopping buying ivory in future are: 1) when they are well aware of the elephant crisis; 2) when they are aware that their ivory will need to kill elephant to gain; 3) when government announcing law and management measures to restrict the ivory trade. In the same survey, when interviewees were asked to select the most powerful measurements to stop ivory consumption, the result indicated that top 3 are: 1) government closing down the domestic market; 2) government enhancing the enforcement; 3) media increase messaging of the elephant crisis.

Output Assumption 2 (Government agencies are open to partnering with WCS on public campaigns).

Over the project period, WCS has successfully partnered with two government agencies and one non-governmental organization run by the Chinese government and hosted within government premises: China Customs, China CITES Management Authority, China Wildlife Conservation Association. This proves this assumption correct.

Output Assumption 3: The Chinese government is receptive to demonstrations of public support for ivory trade restrictions

During the report period, WCS project team cooperated with government agencies in co-hosting a series of campaign for getting public engagement supporting ivory trade restrictions. It includes but not limited to the Huangpu Custom VOC working with China Customs, and the “Challenges and Opportunities- Chinese Enterprises Engagement in Wildlife Conservation in Africa” workshop cooperating with CWCA and China CITES.

4. Impact: achievement of positive impact on illegal wildlife trade and poverty alleviation

The most prominent achievement in regards to combating illegal wildlife trade is the successful adoption of the national ivory trade ban policy by the Chinese government. This IWT project substantially contributed to this achievement via actions promoting a larger consensus over the need for stronger elephant conservation policies among the Chinese citizens (Output 1), the corporate sector (Output 2), and providing targeted recommendations to government legislative and regulatory bodies (Output 3). Given the high-level target, a portion of these activities were undertaken in a concerted fashion with a larger partnership of organizations advocating for similar advancements in wildlife conservation.

Achieving a ban of legal ivory trade is expected to have a substantial impact on the illegal trade as well. Although a percentage of the formerly legal trade might shift underground, we expect the net balance to be a strong reduction in the overall trade volumes. The new policy will considerably simplify the work of law enforcement agencies by eliminating ambiguities and enabling seizure and arrest simply for holding an elephant ivory item on sale. The former system of trade certificates and permissions meant to regulate the legal trade in ivory presented severe weaknesses and loopholes, which allowed apparently legally trading shops to reuse certificates for individual objects for trading an unlimited number of items of the same appearance (e.g. chopsticks). The new policy will also prove as a strong deterrent to prospective buyers. According to a consumer research survey commissioned by the National Geographic in 2012, 37% of the Chinese citizens would be discouraged from purchasing ivory should this be outlawed, followed by an additional 22% should Chinese government leaders denounce the consumption of ivory.

This project focused on the consumption/demand side of the African elephant crisis, nonetheless we expect a positive impact among local communities living in the African elephant range countries in the long term. The ban of the domestic ivory trade in China brings out of the market the largest ivory consumer country in the world, and is expected to result in the disruption of the international illegal ivory trade. This in turn will eventually lead to a decreased pressure from poaching for ivory on the wild African elephant population. Because the project activities focused on the last element of the trade chain (consumers), their impact takes time to propagate upstream, and the relatively short time-frame of this project does not allow for a thorough, fact-based assessment of its impact on the illegal wildlife trade routes and poverty alleviation in the range countries. Based on this project, WCS has evolved a new theory of change as the organizations’ strategy regarding demands for ivory and other endangered wildlife product in China, which will enable the project team to continue advancing the conservation of the African elephant by shifting the focus upwards in the trade chain. The new set of objectives will target Chinese ivory consumers living in African countries witnessing intense flows in ivory products. More details are provided in Section 13 of this report.

5. Project support to the IWT Challenge Fund Objectives and commitments under the London Declaration and Kasane Statement

The goal of this project was to reduce the demand for illegal ivory in China as the single largest consumer market for this commodity. WCS efforts under this grant has contributed to this by delivering targeted behavior-change anti-ivory campaigns, including calling on the Chinese government to take action. We expect these actions to eventually remove a key driver of elephant poaching in Africa, reduce the number of elephants killed, and mitigate the negative impacts of poaching on low income range countries.

The objectives of this project aligned with a number of commitments of both the London Declaration and the Kasane Statement. In particular, the main goal of this project was to undertake effectively targeted actions to eradicate demand for illegal wildlife products, especially through raising awareness and changing behaviour of Chinese consumers (London Declaration nr. 1).

In order to instruct the awareness and behavioural change strategies devised by this project, WCS commissioned a consumer research study to improve understanding of market drivers at the consumption level, and monitor the effectiveness of demand reduction activities. Evidence emerging from these consumer researches contributed to the supporting evidence WCS used to formulate the set of recommendations to the legislative and regulatory bodies, which eventually positively influenced the stronger policies enacted by the Chinese Government outlawing the national trade in ivory, and therefore effectively reducing the demand for illegal ivory products (Kasane Statement nr. 2). In fact, as reported in the previous sections, up to 59% of the Chinese citizens surveyed declared intention to comply with the central government stance and regulations against the trade in ivory. The ban of the national-level trade in ivory is a major advancement towards the reduction of the ivory trade, and empowers law enforcement agencies with new tools while removing the ambiguities surrounding the previous licensing system (London Declaration nr 6.).

Throughout the project, WCS has closely collaborated with the CITES Management Authority for China, promoting awareness of the importance for conservation and role of the CITES Treaties and Conference of the Parties in securing the survival of elephants (London Declaration nr. 3). As part of this work, WCS funded the attendance of key members of the Project Team to the CITES CoP17.

An important component of this project (Outcome 2) aimed at including African elephant conservation within the Corporate Responsibility policies of the private sector (London Declaration nr. 4). WCS engaged with 44 companies who pledged to adopt zero tolerance policies on corporate gifting or accepting of ivory products. Among these, several Chinese state-owned enterprises such as AVIC, and Poly Group which have around 400,000 and 60,000 employees respectively worldwide, and hold an large share of manpower in African countries affected by the elephant crisis. WCS continues to work with these companies, including with their African subsidiaries, to embed conservation messages in their staff orientation package and include them in staff performance guidelines (Kasane Statements nr. 1 and 3). Further work in this direction bridging source and consumption countries is planned as part of the updated Theory of Change as detailed in Section 13 of this report.

6. Impact on species in focus

The project was set to reduce the demand for ivory in China and consequently reduce elephant poaching over the long term. The impact of the project on species is expected to have a significant time lag as consumer behavior progressively changes and affects purchasing decisions across the supply chains.

For indicating species level impact, the most direct and reliable continental measure of

poaching pressure is the Monitoring of Illegal Killing of Elephants (MIKE) program, established by the UN Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species (CITES). There are around 50 MIKE sites across Africa. One measure that results from the MIKE program, the 'Proportion of Illegally Killed Elephants' (PIKE), gives an index of poaching pressure that is independent of the resources put into detection of carcasses.

But given the lag effects along the supply chain, this indicator might be better reviewed in some years after interventions. In March 2017, the PIKE estimated poaching rates for 2016 overall still remain slightly higher than the normal growth rate of elephant populations. But a gradual improvement was detected. In the light of PIKE in 2015, the most positive news comes from Eastern Africa where, in 2016 where the number of illegal killings reported is less than the number of natural deaths reported.

7. Project support to poverty alleviation

The positive support for the reduction of poverty provided to beneficiaries through this project is long term and is expected not be seen during the life time of this project or at project end.

The main beneficiaries of reducing demand for ivory are low-income source countries in Africa and Asia and resource dependent communities living near elephant ranges. Elephants are economically important to source countries. They provide a direct source of GDP through tourism and support subsistence livelihoods through maintaining a healthy resource base. Additionally trafficking has a strongly negative impact on the overall governance and security of source countries through encouraging corruption, undermining border security and encouraging the proliferation of arms and armed groups. High-value wildlife products, such as elephant ivory, are now traded transnationally by organized criminal syndicates. The involvement of transnational criminal networks in wildlife trade exacerbates socio-economic inequalities by disproportionately affecting low-income communities that depend on functioning ecosystem services for their livelihoods, provoking social conflict, and posing grave threats to the wellbeing of people living in areas where poaching of commercially valuable species occurs. For those communities dependent upon tourism (and especially ecotourism) for their livelihoods, poaching and ivory trafficking can also have significant negative and destabilizing consequences for this economy and the livelihoods tourism supports, both through insecurity (global perception of which has negative impacts on visitor numbers) as well as direct impacts on elephant and other wildlife populations themselves.

As noted in the original application form it is outside the scope of this project to monitor the impact of the work conducted in China on low income communities in source countries in Africa.

8. Consideration of gender equality issues

Women, especially from low-income communities, are important beneficiaries due to their major provisioning role in households in source countries producing food, collecting water, firewood, and often running small businesses. Healthy ecosystems support this provisioning through productive soils, more comprehensive pollination services and providing a natural safety net for households to survive on. It is expected that the positive impact of this project on local communities in range countries will show in the long term as the consequences of a reduced demand of ivory in China propagate across the trade chain up to a diminished poaching of African elephants. Due to limited resources, it is outside the scope of this project to monitor the impact of the work conducted in China on low income communities and women in source countries in Africa.

9. Monitoring and evaluation

During the course of the project implementation, WCS has met some difficulties in monitoring the progress towards the stated project outputs and outcomes due to the limited feasibility or

significance of the key performance indicators (KPIs) from the approved project proposal. Such challenges were later made explicit by the IWT Annual Report Review of June 2016.

After the IWT Review, WCS deployed internal consultants and adapted the monitoring methodology to support the project team in working out a better tracking of the project performance, which allowed for a more thorough reporting of the project activities. Meanwhile, an internal senior task force assisted the project team in achieving project objectives in light of both the project progress and the advice shared by the IWT Review. This substantiated in two workshops held in September and December 2016.

In order to amplify the experience and knowledge we gain from this IWT project, WCS China fetch the opportunity of internal review supported by this grant to evolve the current project into an organizational strategy countering demand for ivory and other endangered wildlife products in China. We believed that the project has provided us with valuable foundation for precise campaign development and improved method of social listening and measuring success. This WCS China new theory of change is detailed in Section 13 below.

In terms of Outcome indicators, our internal review clarified a series of indicators summarized below.

The progress reported as part of Outcome Indicator 1 (*The percentage of surveyed consumers whose stated intention to purchase ivory is reduced by 30% by 2017 from a 2012 baseline*) presented the following issues:

- 1) The baseline is surveyed in 2012, three years before the project start. The lack of an assessment at project start weakens the significance of the shift in consumers' attitude identified with the assessment performed at project end.
- 2) The two surveys (2012 baseline and 2016 WCS survey) were performed by different companies with not exactly same methodologies. The 2012 survey conveyed by a Hong Kong company contracted by National Geography used online interview. The 2016 WCS survey was conducted by a mainland China company Wenjuanxin, using online questionnaire to survey. Given that we did not get hold of the original question list of the 2012, the design of 2016 questionnaire might be different from the baseline survey.
- 3) The surveys were limited to one specific category of citizens: Chinese consumers responding to online interview or online survey, with the strong assumptions that ivory consumers are well represented in netizens. However, the fact that the population of Chinese netizens has been consistently growing (668 millions reported in 2016) and online trade is the trend for illegal wildlife products, we are confident this assumption can be met in general.

Given the complexity of the variables involved in these social listening surveys, a more targeted approach on focus groups would have been advisable.

The progress reported as part of Outcome Indicator 2 (*The number of ivory items sold in domestic auctions decreases by 35% by 2017 from a 2014 baseline*) refers only to legal public auctions. Given the new government regulations banning the national trade in ivory, the decrease is effectively 100%. This, however, does not mean clearing the market from ivory trade, as this may shift to private auctions restricted to existing collectors (the new legislation does not ban possession of ivory). In order to more reliably associate this data to a reduction in the trade of ivory, it was advisable to include data indicating a sizeable shift of interest from collectors.

The progress reported as part of Outcome Indicator 3 (*The number of Individuals caught bringing ivory from Africa per bag checked will be reduced by 50% from 2014 levels by February 2017*) is potentially influenced by multiple variables, including:

- 1) From findings of the project team, the China Customs do not collect seizures consistently from each local customs into a central database. But this might be improved in the future when China Customs is now deploying new online cooperative platform in their secured intranet.
- 2) The China Customs does not publicly release data or reports of seizures taking place. Only criminal cases significant or typical will be reported in local news after investigations done.
- 3) A decrease in seizures can well represent both a decrease in the trade as well as a decrease in the enforcement of this illegal trade due to alea or shifting priorities or variability in the capacity of the screening teams.
- 4) Travelers transporting a small number of small-sized objects may more easily get unnoticed, and even should those be seized at the Customs check points this may not result in formal charges against the traveler.

A more focused monitoring of selected Customs check points can help reducing the number of variables in this equation, and increase confidence in the resulting impact data. But this requires building strong connection and good trust with the selected Customs. WCS China is now working closely with Guangdong Customs, and expect to further apply for their internal data on the case number of individual travelers caught with ivory.

The progress reported as part of Outcome Indicator 4 (*The number of Chinese people actively engaged in WCS led anti-ivory campaigns increases by at least 10 times by 2017 compared to a 2014 baseline*) is functional to creating a critical consensus necessary to influence the prioritization of government decisions. However, it shall be noted that engagement in WCS campaigns is not equal to conversions, as followers of WCS social media accounts are likely conservation advocates who do not consume wildlife. If included already at the design phase of each activity, audience reach and engagement tracking can provide more significant indication of the project performance than estimates performed ex-post.

Outcome Indicator 5 (*The Chinese government increases the number of public statements and discussions on reducing the domestic ivory trade in policy fora from a 2014 baseline*) does not adequately reflect the relevance/importance of individual statements, and public statements may not translate in factual actions or enforcement. However, these statements announced in publicity are the only official channels for general public to perceive government's policy acting on ivory trade and consumption, which is indicated as most powerful measurement to change consumer behaviors in various ivory consumer surveys (as reported in Outcome Indicator 1). The decision about the local ivory trade ban and its enactment in 2017 are good measures of success, providing a clear impact, albeit questionable is the extent to which this impact can be attributed to this IWT project.

Concerning Output indicators, results from our internal review are consistent with the feedback provided by the IWT Review. Given the constrains of lacking more powerful social listening methods affordable for this project and the nature of complexity of social media data mining, output Indicator 1.1 (*Conservation of elephants and anti-ivory messaging is one of the top three most popular topics among all environmental topics on the Sina Weibo microblogging platform by July 2017*) needs to embrace compromises of:

- 1) the extent to which the increased ranking of ivory discussions is to be attributed to an increase in the discussions on ivory versus a decrease in the discussions about other topics;
- 2) the extent to which the increased ranking of ivory discussions can be attributed to the activities implemented as part of this project, net of the messages directly posted by WCS.

Output Indicator 1.2 (*At least 60 articles and multimedia materials on elephants and ivory per year are translated or re-versioned into Chinese*) and 1.3 (*At least 25 feature reports discussing negative impacts of the ivory trade are produced by journalists*) have limitations in measuring the quality and/or impact of the project activities in relation to Output 1. The impact of these deliverables could have been measured through their reach and the discussions they fostered among the public.

Output Indicator 1.4 (*10,000,000 Chinese citizens are “shared” a wide range of social and traditional media content about elephant and ivory issues*) and 1.5 (*At least 100,000 interactions are made on elephants and ivory issues*) shall be considered together as metrics of reach and engagement from the project activities. While this data was carefully collected from social media pages managed by WCS, the biggest share of the impact reported comes from estimates of which no detailed breakdown is available.

Output Indicator 1.6 (*Raw ivory in Guangzhou shows a price plateau or decrease by 2017*) is outside of the reach of this project as none of the activities are specifically designed to affect the price of ivory within the short term of this project. Even though the Chinese government policy shift announcements might have had a substantial impact on the price of ivory, due to the variables involved it is more likely that such impact substantiated in a higher volatility of the prices, therefore a more thorough research shall be carried out to assess if the ban resulted in a net increase or decrease of the ivory price.

Output Indicator 1.7 (*Reduction of 20% by 2017 of ivory trade transactions on Chinese Twitter (Sina Weibo). Sina Weibo has become an important online peer-to-peer trading hub as well as a forum where people publically update others with life events.*) is based on the unsubstantiated belief that ivory consumers are well represented on the Weibo social media platform and use this platform for trading in wildlife despite WeChat – the most popular social media platform in China with 817 million monthly active users in September 2016 (versus 290 million of Weibo) – allowing for lower public scrutiny thanks to its private groups, and featuring embedded virtual shops and peer-to-peer money transfer functions. But Weibo is still running the 2nd most popular social media platform in China. And given the well setup baseline done by WCS in 2013 from surveying Sina Weibo, we believe this indicator is still consistent and powerful.

10. Lessons learnt

The project is a valuable lesson learning process for the team. We suffered from responding some challenges to the project implementation and development, as described in Section 9. Meanwhile, we also feel compelled at reporting our achievements through the original set of indicators given they were vetted positively by IWT at the time of the project submission and approval. Here are some most valuable lessons we learnt from the project:

The project team has faced difficulties in achieving a factual engagement of the corporate sector beyond securing in-kind donations. Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) objectives are rarely focused on wildlife trade issues in China and WCS therefore needed to construct an incentive package to encourage companies to sign up the binding pledge that they would reject ivory. WCS China created the Guardian Award, a national award scheme to incentivize a variety of actors in China to engage in wildlife protection more effectively. Whilst mainly focused on frontline law enforcement agencies, with this project WCS also started promoting a greater engagement from leading private sector actors. From this experience we have learnt that corporate sector is not very responsive to changes in the consumers attitudes and government policies when they are not closely related to the primary business of the company. Therefore, incentives precisely targeting company’s relevance are likely to be necessary to foster private sector engagement.

Shed in lights of this, WCS internal review suggested to focus corporate engagement on those having significant investment and staff input in elephant range countries in Africa, especially those of state own (SOE). The leverage for involving Chinese SOE in Africa for CSR is to mitigate their risk of staff committing wildlife crime carrying ivory items back to China and to lift the image of Chinese enterprise in environmental responsibility in foreign country. These ideas have been well accepted by some SOEs previously cooperated with WCS in this project, e.g. Poly Tech., and the team have already convened such strategy into latest project activities such as the workshop for Chinese SOEs during this report period as reported in Section 3.1.

The challenge of tightening regulation of international NGOs operating in China is unexpectedly strong. Increasing government attention and oversight of NGO activities has created significant issues in securing the necessary partnerships with Chinese civil society and private sector actors who are nervous about working with such foreign entities under close government scrutiny. Fortunately, WCS is respected as down to ground and trusted organization with long term cooperation with government and enforcement agencies, and therefore most activities are not significantly affected in this project, but requiring more attentions from the team to secure our government partner's involvement.

Recognizing that the original set of progress indicators to measure advancement towards the Outcome may have some shortcomings, as also pointed out in the IWT report review, the project team adjusted and adapted our monitoring methods in regard to constrains of reality and feasibility. But lesson learning is that it would have been more powerful indicators setting if we could breakdown those indicators into a whole set of more detailed indexes. Therefore, if one index is not achievable or effective enough in monitoring, the team could use other index in the same group for compensation.

11. Actions taken in response to previous reviews (if applicable)

WCS welcomed the feedback included in the IWT Review, which has been helpful in guiding the project team understanding of the project status and the weaknesses of the original theory of change included in the approved project proposal.

Following this Review, WCS set up an internal senior task force to assist the project team in revising the project objectives in light of both the project achievements and the advice shared by IWT. This substantiated in two workshops held in September and December 2016, which resulted in the new theory of change detailed in Section 13.

Additionally, the project team extended the discussion around its behavioural change theory to external experts and partner organizations including Jan Kaderly (96elephant campaign), Eric Phu (digital marketing expert), and Dudao (Chinese data mining company), . We have also joined the Steering Group of the Wildlife Consumer Behaviour Change Toolkit chaired by TRAFFIC to share lessons and coordinate efforts.

Based on comments from IWT and our internal project review, WCS has taken three actions in response to the Review:

- Discuss behavioural change campaigns with big corporate sectors that have a large number of Chinese employees in Africa. Poly Technologies, who has been involved in previous public commitment, is willing to work on further behavioural change campaigns among their employees. Poly is one of the biggest companies investing in Africa and with 3,000 Chinese staff travelling to African each year. They also have very close relationship with the Central Chinese Government Through this effort, we can demonstrate how big companies can be involved in direct behaviour change work among Poly's network.
- WCS China is pitching the SynTao consultancy (syntao.com) serving state owned enterprises in Africa and Asia. They offer consultancy services about overseas investments to 50 Chinese companies and one Kenya and China Economic Association whose membership consists of 60 state owned enterprises in Africa. This consultancy group is willing to share best practices from our project among its network and encourage companies to take similar actions. Potential training courses for those companies, "no ivory consumption" materials for staff orientation package, and performance guidelines will be delivered through their channel to scale up the impact among Chinese companies and Chinese employees in Africa.
- WCS has initiated to focus on Chinese state owned enterprises in Uganda and plan to reduce the trade of ivory and other wildlife products through the experience and practice from this project. The workshop held in March "Challenges and Opportunities- Chinese

Enterprises Engagement in Wildlife Conservation in Africa” is exactly an attempt for this IWT project to bridge future investment in the field of demand reduction of WCS China.

12. Other comments on progress not covered elsewhere

none

13. Sustainability and legacy

The policy change on ivory consumption occurred in China represents an exceptional achievement for conservation organizations, shifting from an active support of the legal trade in ivory to a complete ban in the domestic trade of this wildlife product.

Following this game-changing event, WCS has brainstormed how to move its demand reduction activities to the next level, which resulted in a new Theory of Change, through which the Project Team extends its focus to the Chinese communities overseas.

WCS has evidence of a considerable market of ivory products serving Chinese customers either living in Africa or traveling for leisure or business to the continent. We assume that Chinese citizens either living in Africa or traveling for leisure or business to the continent consume moderate quantities of ivory, and engage in small scale trafficking for personal or family purposes (gifting), but also can become the victims of organized trafficking activity. For example, WCS China assisted Baiyun Customs Anti-Smuggling Bureau on the prosecution of a case that a Chinese living in Nigeria facilitated several ivory and rhino horn smuggling cases without carrying any products by himself but manipulated Chinese travelers to Africa to engage in the crime by using their ignorance of law and law enforcement.

With the “Going Out Policy” by the Chinese government, both Chinese tourists and the migrant workers hired by Chinese Business to Africa are expected to significantly increase in the future. Given the large expatriate community, we believe that the aggregate consumption of ivory does still pose a threat to the survival of the African elephant population and crime prevention is essential to reduce the risk. Our response has three objectives: 1) increase the perceived risk of carrying ivory from Africa to China to become equivalent as carrying drugs; 2) decrease the number of incidents of ivory trafficking involving Chinese staff employed at Chinese state owned enterprises; 3) promote the perception of trading ivory overseas as harmful to China’s national pride.

Progress towards these objectives will be tracked through a set of indicators developed following the guidelines generously offered by the IWT Review.

For Objective 1:

- Law enforcement agencies increase ivory seizures on China Africa route
- Enforcement actions and court decisions are publicized widely
- Tourist sector (Airlines/Tour Operators) promotes deterrent messages

For Objective 2:

- Chinese state owned enterprises HR policy provides internal sanctions for occurrences of wildlife crimes
- Opinion leaders promote elephant conservation and corporate responsibility

For Objective 3:

- China promotes inclusion of wildlife conservation into companies’ corporate social responsibility, human resources policy guidelines
- Chinese community networks in Africa advocate to not buy ivory

WCS plans to seek additional funding from IWT to pursue these objectives and advance our ivory demand reduction strategy targeting Chinese people.

14. IWT Challenge Fund Identity

This project is focused on changing consumer behaviour in China through leveraging the influence of groups and individuals such as investment advisors, government agencies and the

peers of potential consumers. The campaigns and activities created by WCS are therefore not branded with either the name of WCS or any donor in order to maximise the impact of the message. International funding and NGO activity can be also be a slightly sensitive issue in China.

15. Project expenditure

Please expand and complete Table 1.

Table 1: Project expenditure during the reporting period (April 2016-March 2017)

Project spend (indicative) since last annual report	2016/17 Grant (£)	2016/17 Total actual IWT Costs (£)	Variance %	Comments (please explain significant variances)
Staff costs (see below)				
Consultancy costs				
Overhead Costs				
Travel and subsistence				
Operating Costs				
Capital items (see below)				
Others (see below)				
TOTAL				

Highlight any agreed changes to the budget and **fully** explain any variation in expenditure where this is +/- 10% of the budget. Have these changes been discussed with and approved by IWT?

16. OPTIONAL: Outstanding achievements of your project during the reporting period (300-400 words maximum). This section may be used for publicity purposes

I agree for the IWT Secretariat to publish the content of this section (please leave this line in to indicate your agreement to use any material you provide here)

During this project period WCS China has reached and secured the participation of over 150 thousand Chinese people in our online and offline anti-ivory campaigns. These individuals and groups have been targeted specifically as they fall within the 'high-risk' category for ivory consumption based on consumer profiling. Additionally WCS is leading the only Chinese

economic study which will provide credible and specific policy recommendations designed to support effective and efficient ivory-ban policy development for the Chinese government. During this project period this research project has convened two international expert working groups and delivered two specific policy briefings outlining the most rational, effective and economic methodology for phasing out the ivory trade in China and removing the ability of smugglers to launder illegal ivory within China.

This research and its potential policy implications are vital for the implementation of a successful ban in China. Providing clear, concise and evidence based approaches to an effective ban from respected Chinese academics and policy actors is key to securing the action that is needed. Options such as a temporary or partial moratorium on ivory sales are likely to be counterproductive and actually spur further poaching in anticipation of future open markets, much in the way that the original CITES 10 year moratorium on ivory sales did following the one off stockpile sale to China and Japan in 2008.

The number of Chinese people actively engaged in WCS led anti-ivory campaigns increases by at least 10 times by 2017 compared to a 2014 baseline. This is functional to creating a critical consensus necessary to influence the prioritization of government decisions.

Output Assumption 2 (Government agencies are open to partnering with WCS on public campaigns).

Annex 1: Report of progress and achievements against Logical Framework for Financial Year 2016-2017

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
<p>Impact</p> <p>The project will reduce the demand for ivory and thus reduce elephant poaching over the long term.</p> <p>The Impact is not intended to be achieved solely by the project. This is a higher-level situation that the project will contribute towards achieving. All IWT Challenge Fund projects are expected to contribute to tackling the illegal wildlife trade and supporting poverty alleviation in developing countries. The ivory trade is no longer a threat to the survival of all elephant species.</p>		<p>(Report on any contribution towards positive impact on illegal wildlife trade or positive changes in the conditions of human communities impacted by illegal trade e.g. steps towards alternative and sustainable livelihoods)</p>	

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
<p>Outcome (Insert original project Outcome statement)</p> <p><i>This project will activate the Chinese public to engage in anti-ivory campaigns, including calling on the Chinese government to take action to significantly undermine the current demand for ivory. As a result, this project will interrupt a key driver of elephant poaching in Africa, reduce the number of elephants killed, and mitigate the negative impacts of poaching on low income source countries.</i></p>	<p>(Insert original purpose/outcome level indicators)</p> <p>#1 The percentage of surveyed consumers whose stated intention to purchase ivory is reduced by 30% by 2017 from a 2012 baseline.#</p> <p>#2 The number of ivory items sold in domestic auctions decreases by 35% by 2017 from a 2014 baseline. #</p> <p>#3 The number of Individuals caught bringing ivory from Africa per bag checked will be reduced by 50% from 2014 levels by February 2017.#</p> <p>#4 The number of Chinese people actively engaged in WCS led anti-ivory campaigns increases by at least 10 times by 2017 compared to a 2014 baseline. #</p> <p>#5 The Chinese government increases the number of public statements and discussions on reducing the domestic ivory trade in policy fora from a 2014 baseline (2 official statements).#</p>	<p>(Report against the indicators on progress towards achieving the project outcome)</p> <p>#1 In 2016 Dec., WCS online survey indicated: 36.4 % of surveyed ivory consumers stated no intention to purchase ivory anymore. Also, almost 91% of the survey interviewees have agreed to ban ivory in market. (2012 baseline, National Geography report, 84% of ivory consumers still intend to buy ivory in future.)</p> <p># 2 The Ivory Ban announcement from the General Office of the State Council of the People's Republic of China has stressed the country will stop all its legal commercial sales – physical and online -- of elephant ivory in 2017; number of ivory items sold in legal domestic auctions has decreased to zero.</p> <p>#3 need Lishu to provide data</p> <p>#4 Over 8 million people are exposed to WCS-led campaigns and events during the past year. Regarding on-the-ground activities, during “Bring No Ivory Home” VOC campaigns, at least 500 people are making the pledges not to consume Ivory; The promotion event at Beijing Zoo also attracted more than 500 people to learn about elephant and Ivory related issues. People also actively participated online by liking, commenting, and retweeting on WCS social media.</p> <p>#5 The Chinese government has announced the Ivory Ban in 2016 and will phase out its legal commercial sales-both online and offline-by the end of 2017. By the end of this report period, between 2015 and 2017 Mrach, total of 9 statementsm</p>	<p>(Highlight key actions planned for next period)</p>

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
<p>Output 1. (Insert original outputs with activities relevant to that outputs in lines below. Activities relevant to more than one output should be cross-referenced rather than repeated)</p> <p>A greater number of Chinese consumers perceive ivory to be an undesirable product and engage in anti-ivory campaigns to support government action</p>	<p>(Insert original output level indicators)</p> <p>#1 Conservation of elephants and anti-ivory messaging is one of the top three most popular topics among all environmental topics on the Sina Weibo microblogging platform by July 2017, a rise from the 9th ranking topic in this category in 2013</p> <p>#2 At least 60 articles and multimedia materials on elephants and ivory per year are translated or re-versioned into Chinese and disseminated via WCS online and social media platforms in the project period.</p> <p>#3 At least 25 feature reports discussing negative impacts of the ivory trade are produced by journalists joining the Wildlife Conservation Media Incubator (described in Activity 1.3) and published on major traditional media outlets (averaging 10 per year).</p> <p>#4 10,000,000 Chinese citizens are “shared” a wide range of social and traditional media content about elephant and ivory issues each year in 2015, 2016 and 2017.</p> <p>#5 At least 100,000 interactions (likes, retweets, comments, and clicks) are made on elephants and ivory issues through social and online media each year in 2015, 2016, and 2017.</p> <p>#6 Based on a 2014 baseline, raw ivory in Guangzhou (China’s primary ivory carving hub) shows a price plateau or decrease by 2017. Additionally, the ETIS Transaction Index records a decreasing trend in recorded shipments of ivory to China from 2014 – 2017. These are paired as price changes alone cannot show a reduction in demand, a price drop twinned with a restriction in supply should provide a good indicator of demand reduction.</p> <p>#7 A reduction of 20% by 2017 (from a baseline of 1566 separate trading tweets for ivory between June-November 2013) of ivory trade transactions on Chinese Twitter (Sina Weibo). Sina Weibo has become an important online peer-to-peer trading hub as well as a forum where people publically update others with life events.</p>		<p>(Report general progress and appropriateness of indicator, and reference where evidence is provided e.g. <i>Evidence provided in section 3.2 of report and Annex X</i>)</p> <p>Conservation of elephants and anti-ivory messaging is among top three most popular topics among all environmental topics on the Sina Weibo. And almost 50 articles have been translated and published via WCS online and social media platforms in the project period. Nine feature reports discussing negative impacts of the ivory trade are produced by journalists have been published on paper, magazine and TV. During 2016-17 period, social and traditional media content about elephant and ivory issues have been viewed more than 140 million times, with average 35 million times per year. Also, more than 100,000 interactions (likes, retweets, comments, and clicks) are made on elephants and ivory issues through social and online media each year, and by the time of 2016, the total number of interaction has reached 900,000.(Evidence provided in Doodao report)</p>
<p>Activity 1.1 (Insert activities relevant to this output)</p> <p>Design innovative interactive social media campaigns (e.g. Voices of China) which are tailored for use through portable devices and promote and capture direct public commitment “not to bring ivory home” (a key message “branded” with Voices of China and</p>		<p>(Report completed or progress on activities that contribute toward achieving this output, and what will be carried out in the next period)</p> <p>#1 To reach audience, WCS provided technical advice for the performance “Walk with the Beast” by actor Li Ding aired on August 3, 2016 as part of the “I’m Mad about Comedy” evening show on Hubei Satellite TV. This performance was</p>	

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
used across all campaigns).		broadcasted to over 8,880,000 people, who learned about the threat ivory poses to elephant conservation.	
Activity 1.2 Transform international media content on the elephant crisis into materials that are accessible to the general Chinese public through the first comprehensive Chinese-language website on elephants and ivory trade (iudaxiang.org)		# There have been 47 translated or pieces of article posted on WCS's official Wechat and Weibo account focusing on elephant crisis from June 2016 to now.	
Activity 1.3 Expand social media and traditional media coverage on ivory and elephants through the Wildlife Conservation Media Incubator, a social-media-based network that will provide technical, logistic, and editorial support to journalists covering diverse topics that influence ivory consumption (e.g. fashion, religion, travel).		<p>#1 The project team collaborated with Huangpu Customs in January and launched "Stand for Elephant, Drive/Bring no Ivory home" VOC campaigns at cargo inspection gateways and railway stations, promoting law and Ivory ban amongst target audience (shipping industry/cargo drivers and travelers) who play the crucial role at illegal wildlife trade chain and to encourage them to obey the law and spontaneously make promises not to transfer or consume Ivory. Through this activity, the project team has secured 6 media reports in different angels have been generated on influential newspapers and media platforms, and 17 reposts have been put on governmental news hub such like <i>Xinhua.net</i>, people.om.cn and portal website like <i>Sina</i> and <i>Netease</i>. So far, on a conservative estimate, the total exposure of paper news reaches 6 million readers, and online exposure approximately reaches half million.</p> <p>#2 Through the "Challenges and Opportunities- Chinese Enterprises Engagement in Wildlife Conservation in Africa" workshop on March, the project team pitched 6 media reports (25+reposts)with different media camps such like central government media, video& TV, magazine and newspaper all paying attention to this topic. So far, on a conservative estimate, the news has reached approximately half million readers/listeners/viewers by paper, video and radio platforms.</p>	

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
<p>Activity 1.4</p> <p>Promote online campaigns to destroy desirability of ivory through partnerships with online media and platforms (such as mainstream online forums, portals, etc.) that provide free advertising and feature content on elephants and poaching.</p>		<p>#1 To promote the China domestic ivory ban, the project team pitched 3 in-depth news reports on top media platforms including China Daily, The Paper with circulation and exposure of 2,300,000 audience discussing two hot issues: US announced their Ivory ban, and US-China Strategic and Economic Dialogue.</p> <p>#2 The General Office of the State Council of the People's Republic of China issued on Dec 30, 2016 about stopping all commercial sales and working of ivory and its products in China by the end of 2017. The announcement from the General Office of the State Council of the People's Republic of China has stressed the country will stop all its legal commercial sales – physical and online -- of elephant ivory in 2017. One month before the ban, the project team has witnessed the online platform might the place with legal loopholes after ban, therefore we pitched a China News Weekly reporter to discuss this problem. And this is the first in-depth report published in China which specifically focused on ivory onlinetrade in both English and Chinese. On the first day of the ban execution, SNAP ivory expert Dr. Zhangli has been on air by <i>China 24</i>, a CCTV English channel to elaborate research results of SNAP and further promote the legal process and the next steps for the ban. On the second day of the ban, WCS has pushed the China Daily to discuss how should government deal with legal ivory stockpiles after ban, which again pointed out the aftermath of ban.</p> <p>#3 The project team has partnered with The Paper Haomiao Cosmic column to regularly produce wildlife protection content(Pangolins and Chinese alligators for now) to publish on the Paper as well as social media platforms. In the future, the project team plan to work with the Paper to generate feature content on elephants and poaching.</p>	

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
<p>Output 2. (Insert original output)</p> <p>Influential Chinese companies are engaged and mobilised to take action to reduce ivory consumption</p>	<p>(Insert original output level indicators)</p> <p>#1 100 companies publicly pledge “not to bring ivory home” by the end of the project period including Companies with high likelihood of impacting ivory consumption (i.e. Chinese enterprises operating in Africa, major Chinese travel agencies)</p> <p>#2 50 private sector actors (such as travel agencies, art houses, fashion brands, and civil society organizations) will provide sponsorship and/or donate resources to anti-ivory behavioral change campaigns per year during the project period.</p> <p>#3 10,000,000 people exposed (via foot traffic, attendance at events, etc.) to on-the-ground behavioral change campaigns co-implemented by WCS and corporate partners within project period.</p>	<p>(Report against the indicators on progress towards achieving the output)</p>	

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
<p>Activity 2.1</p> <p>Coordinate with private sector entities to publicize their statements to stop ivory consumption through social media and traditional media in order to reach a broad audience.</p>		<p>#1 By the “Stand for Elephant, Drive/Bring no Ivory home” VOC campaign collaborating with Huangpu Customs at cargo inspection gateways and railway stations, the project team initiated the first “Declaration of Self-discipline against Transportation of Illegal Wildlife and Product” among Hong Yuan Group and 7 shipping companies and publicized their statements through traditional and social media platforms.</p> <p>#2 The project team has made partnership with the Jane Goodall Institute China--- Roots & Shoots Beijing Office and displayed “Guardians of Elephant” posters in Beijing Zoo where enjoys an annual tourists of 4 millions. The team is also involved in their college students program and reached over 60 thousands college students for their elephant conservation proposals.</p> <p>#3 Partnered with Raffles Academy which helped with graphic design for campaign and event. The project team has also invited the fashion designers of the school to produce “Consume No Ivory” statements and plan to promote on social media and fashion websites.</p> <p>#4 Partnering with CWCA and Beijing Zoo on the fourth World Wildlife Day in a public exhibition to educate tourists and children against ivory consumption, and publicized accordingly on social media platforms.</p> <p>#5 Partnering with the Lighthouse Academy and initiated an intern program which the elephant team has assisted in translating ivory related news and social media development.</p> <p>#6 Partnering with Tencent and Doodod company to co-launch ivory consumption survey online. The survey has been promoted through social media, attracting more than 1, 200 netizens to fill in survey, which has helped build baseline for stopping ivory consumption,</p>	
<p>Activity 2.2</p> <p>Partner with leading Chinese travel industry actors such as travel e-commerce websites, airlines, and freight carriers to secure pledges of Chinese travelers and workers in Africa not to buy ivory.</p>		<p>#1 The project team launched a VOC campaign at Changping Railway station where travelers commute mainly between Hong Kong and Guangdong Province. Over this two-day campaign, the team secured about 130 pledges of travelers, promising “bring no Ivory home”; and at least 50,000 numbers of travelers have been exposed to the posters by the end of February, 2017. 26 cargos were put with “Stand for Elephant, Drive No Ivory Home” stickers, traveling between Dongguan, Shenzhen, Hongkong, and Macao, exposed to approximately 2800 miles per day.</p> <p>#2 Three campaign proposals regarding travelers and workers in Africa have been received from interns and are planning to carry out in the next year if possible.</p>	

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
<p>Activity 2.3</p> <p>Engage top corporations and strategic industries in the design and implementation of behavioral change campaigns to make ivory undesirable.</p>		<p>#1 Discuss behavioural change campaigns with big corporate sectors that have a large number of Chinese employees in Africa. Poly Technologies, who has been involved in previous public commitment, is willing to work on further behavioural change campaigns among their employees. WCS is working with them to develop “no ivory consumption” publicity materials for their staff orientation package and for their staff performance guidelines. We will develop a questionnaire to track behavioural change before and after those campaigns through the CSR department of Poly. Poly is one of the biggest companies investing in Africa and with 3,000 Chinese staff travelling to Africa each year. They also have very close relationship with the Cebtral Chinese Government Through this effort, we can demonstrate how big companies can be involved in direct behaviour change work among Poly’s network.</p> <p>#2 WCS, together with CWCA and SynTao, hosts “Challenges and Opportunities- Chinese Enterprises Engagement in Wildlife Conservation in Africa” conference on March. With almost 80 participants, the conference aims to involve a broad representation of Chinese and international stakeholders to raise awareness and convene a dialogue around impact, role of Chinese enterprise engagement in wildlife conservation in Africa. 15 companies attended the conference including 11 Chinese SoEs. General consensus has reached and increased willingness to engage in addressing wildlife conservation challenges in Africa among participating Chinese SOE/POE participants and also greater awareness of WCS expertise, experience, and approaches in developing science-based solutions to challenges in wildlife conservation.</p> <p>#3 WCS China is pitching a CSR consultancy (http://www.syntao.com/index_EN.asp) mainly serving state owned enterprises in Africa and Asia. They offer consultancy services about overseas investments to 50 Chinese companies and one Kenya and China Economic Association whose membership consists of 60 state owned enterprises in Africa. This consultancy group is willing to share best practices from our project among its network and encourage companies to take similar actions. Potential training courses for those companies, “no ivory consumption” materials for staff orientation package, and performance guidelines will be delivered through their channel to scale up the impact among Chinese companies and Chinese employees in Africa.</p>	

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
<p>Output 3.</p> <p>Economic, social and political justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market are provided to government agencies through influential channels and networks</p>	<p>#1 Findings of 2 research reports with policy justifications published through top 10 social media platforms/top 100 traditional media each year to stimulate bottom-up influence over government decision makers (Baseline=1 in 2013).</p> <p># 2 A total of 3 proposals each year calling for restricting the ivory trade are delivered on public proposal channels to the China People’s Political Consultative Conference, in 2015 = 3, 2016 = 3 (Baseline = 2 in 2014).</p> <p>#3 At least 3 government agencies engage in WCS-led public sensitization campaigns against ivory consumption each year. (Baseline = 0 in 2013).</p>	<p><u>Study Progress</u></p> <p>Based on the research conducted in the first half year of 2016, the working group (WG) has been further finalizing the key studies, including risk assessments on different timeline scenarios and its impact on speculation, a legislative assessment to the legality of the proposed ivory trade ban, an assessment to the cost and most effective approach to enforce the ban, analyses of public perception of the proposed ivory ban, and finally a study investigating how the China ivory trade may affect African elephant range states. WG is also leading a desk review on the impact of China ivory trade on African elephant range states in political, economic, and local community livelihood aspects. Chinese market monitoring for both legal and illegal ivory sales conducted by WCS China serves as supplementary data and information for the WG indicating the market demand and supply reacting to policies.</p> <p><u>Working Group Meeting</u></p> <p>During August 3rd to 5th ,2016, the third international working group meeting was convened in Beijing, 14 international and national experts and members of WG from different areas attended. The meeting mainly comprised two parts, firstly experts updated their key research findings, then discussed problems encountered during implementation and proposed work plan for next step. During the 3rd meeting, WG developed and agreed upon a policy recommendation based on results from above studies and adjustments for finalizing them. Please refer to the attached “The Economics of the Chinese Ivory Trade 3rd Working Group Meeting Briefing Report” for more details.</p> <p><u>Communication and Delivery</u></p> <p>The summarized policy recommendation has been presented to the ivory policy making authority and CITES management authority in China. PIs and experts from the SNAP WG has convened the recommendations and results of Project to <i>three</i> most influential international conventions. During the IUCN World Conservation Congress and CITES CoP 17, in which various ivory trade related proposals have been discussed among parties, SNAP WG members as well as other senior staff of WCS participated and supported the delegates to influence on China’s strategy on enhancing ivory domestic markets. In the Hanoi Conference on Illegal Wildlife Trade, a key policy recommendation from the Project was presented to the Duke of Cambridge, and to the Royal Foundation.</p> <p>The research outcomes are being delivered in academic journals and online platforms. One journal articles and eight op-ed blogs were published. One peer-review paper is under journal review. Four manuscripts are under editing for journal submission.</p>	

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
<p>Activity 3.1</p> <p>Execute long-term campaigns with government agencies that support their efforts to reduce the illegal ivory trade and encourage the Chinese public not to bring ivory home.</p>		<p>#1 WG members have communicated the policy recommendations to China's ivory policy making department (Conservation Department of State Forestry Administration) and CITES management authorities as well as influential congress member of National People's Congress and China People's Political Consultancy Committee (CPPCC).</p> <p>#2 WG has been actively working with WCS China's communication team to cooperate influential medias both domestic and international. Key messages and outputs from the Project on recommending a strong and effective ban of ivory domestic trade in China are featured or used as supplementary reference in 44 media articles in China and internationally.</p>	
<p>Activity 3.2</p> <p>Coordinate influential partners to present justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market to government ministries and political advisory bodies based on 1) the economic drivers and costs of the current model of limited legal trade in China; 2) the overall impact on people who work in ivory trade; 3) the potential impact on China's global image; 4) overall cost-benefit ratio of the ivory trade for local livelihoods, ecosystems, and other issues of human security in key African elephant range states where poaching occurs; and 5) opportunities for more sustainable Chinese investment in Africa</p>		<p>#1 The research key findings and policy recommendations produced in the WG meetings have been delivered to the CITES CoP 17 and IUCN World Conservation Congress. In these two meetings, various ivory trade related proposals have been discussed among parties, SNAP WG members as well as other senior staff of WCS participated and supported the delegates to influence on China's strategy on enhancing ivory domestic markets. Moreover, the delegates have been emboldened by the IUCN vote to adopt a resolution submitted by African governments that also calls for closure of domestic ivory markets. All these actions have kept momentum behind shutting down the ivory markets which have devastated elephant populations, and for taking all the other actions vital to ensure elephants have a future.</p> <p>#2 In the Conference on Illegal Wildlife Trade held in Hanoi on November 17 and 18, 2016, a key policy recommendation from the Project was presented to the Duke of Cambridge, and to the Royal Foundation by Project Manager, who introduced the current status of ivory ban in China and expressed the strong concern that the ivory ban might not as effective as we expect. As the administration body is likely to give longer time for legal traders to sale stockpiles. Meanwhile, speculators might want to stock more inventory as preparation for future market or prevent other speculators entering the market in the future, resulting in continuing poaching which against the original purpose of ivory trade ban. The Duke of Cambridge committed to pass the concern to top leaders of Chinese government through his channel looking forward to upscaling the issue's political profile and promoting the effectiveness of the ivory ban.</p>	

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements April 2016 - March 2017	Actions required/planned for next period
<p>Activity 3.3</p> <p>Deliver up-to-date data on the elephant crisis to sensitize director- and manager-level Chinese government decision makers to the urgent need for policy changes that will limit trade in ivory.</p>		<p>#1 WG members have communicated the policy recommendations to China's ivory policy making department (Conservation Department of State Forestry Administration) and CITES management authorities as well as influential congress member of National People's Congress and China People's Political Consultancy Committee (CPPCC).</p> <p># 2 The wider Working Group is in regular communication with policy makers in SFA in both formal and informal settings to keep stakeholders in the loops of research results and opinion.</p>	

Annex 2: Project's full current logframe as presented in the application form (unless changes have been agreed)

N.B. if your application's logframe is presented in a different format in your application, please transpose into the below template. Please feel free to contact IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk if you have any questions regarding this.

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of verification	Important Assumptions
Impact: The project will reduce the demand for ivory and thus reduce elephant poaching over the long term.			

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of verification	Important Assumptions
<p>Outcome:</p> <p>This project will activate the Chinese public to engage in anti-ivory campaigns, including calling on the Chinese government to take action to significantly undermine the current demand for ivory. As a result, this project will interrupt a key driver of elephant poaching in Africa, reduce the number of elephants killed, and mitigate the negative impacts of poaching on low income source countries.</p>	<p>1 The percentage of surveyed consumers whose stated intention to purchase ivory is reduced by 30% by 2017 from a 2012 baseline.</p> <p>2 The number of ivory items sold in domestic auctions decreases by 35% by 2017 from a 2014 baseline.</p> <p>3 The number of Individuals caught bringing ivory from Africa per bag checked will be reduced by 50% from 2014 levels by February 2017.</p> <p>4 The number of Chinese people actively engaged in WCS led anti-ivory campaigns increases by at least 10 times by 2017 compared to a 2014 baseline.</p> <p>5 The Chinese government increases the number of public statements and discussions on reducing the domestic ivory trade in policy fora from a 2014 baseline (to be established).</p>	<p>1 A market survey in 2017 with the same scope and target groups as the National Geographic/IFOP market survey from which baseline data were taken.</p> <p>2 Monitoring reports on the volume of legal domestic auctions featuring ivory products from Artron, a Chinese art portal and industry service provider (http://www.artron.net/).</p> <p>3 China Customs' records and synthesis of media reports of illegal trafficking announced by Chinese law enforcement agencies at the national and provincial levels (Shanghai, Beijing and Guangzhou).</p> <p>4 WCS project reports</p> <p>5 Press releases and monitoring reports on policy fora</p>	<p>1 Government action is the most effective way to reduce ivory consumption, especially to make it illegal to purchase ivory under any circumstances (National Geographic/IFOP study).</p> <p>2 In line with official statements made during the 2013 London summit, the Chinese government is committed to combatting the illegal wildlife trade.</p> <p>3 Anti-ivory campaigns that mobilize citizens directly through interactive social media tools can achieve greater impact on consumer behavior than traditional Public Service Announcements approaches.</p>

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of verification	Important Assumptions
<p>Output 1: A greater number of Chinese consumers perceive ivory to be an undesirable product and engage in anti-ivory campaigns to support government action</p>	<p>1.1 Conservation of elephants and anti-ivory messaging is one of the top three most popular topics among all environmental topics on the Sina Weibo microblogging platform by July 2017, a rise from the 9th ranking topic in this category in 2013</p> <p>1.2 At least 60 articles and multimedia materials on elephants and ivory per year are translated or re-versioned into Chinese and disseminated via WCS online and social media platforms in the project period.</p> <p>1.3. At least 25 feature reports discussing negative impacts of the ivory trade are produced by journalists joining the Wildlife Conservation Media Incubator (described in Activity 1.3) and published on major traditional media outlets (averaging 10 per year).</p> <p>1.4 10,000,000 Chinese citizens are “shared” a wide range of social and traditional media content about elephant and ivory issues each year in 2015, 2016 and 2017.</p> <p>1.5 At least 100,000 interactions (likes, retweets, comments, and clicks) are made on elephants and ivory issues through social and online media each year in 2015, 2016, and 2017.</p> <p>1.6 Based on a 2014 baseline, raw ivory in Guangzhou (China’s primary ivory carving hub) shows a price plateau or decrease by 2017. Additionally, the ETIS Transaction Index records a decreasing trend in recorded shipments of ivory to China from 2014 – 2017. These are paired as price changes alone cannot show a reduction in demand, a price drop twinned with a restriction in supply should provide a good indicator of demand reduction.</p> <p>1.7 A reduction of 20% by 2017 (from a baseline of 1566 separate trading tweets for ivory between June-November 2013) of ivory trade transactions on Chinese Twitter (Sina Weibo). Sina Weibo has become an important online peer-to-peer trading hub as well as a forum where people publically update others with life events.</p>	<p>1.1 Reports on CIC social media monitoring analyses</p> <p>1.2-1.7 Project monitoring reports on targeted social medial platforms, traditional media channels and online portals .</p> <p>ETIS reports and market surveys in Guangzhou</p>	<p>1 Chinese consumer behavior can be influenced by other consumers, media, corporate actors and the government.</p> <p>2 Government agencies are open to partnering with WCS on public sensitization campaigns.</p> <p>3 The Chinese government is receptive to demonstrations of public support for greater restrictions on the ivory trade.</p>

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of verification	Important Assumptions
<p>Output 2:: Influential Chinese companies are engaged and mobilised to take action to reduce ivory consumption</p>	<p>2.1 100 companies publicly pledge “not to bring ivory home” by the end of the project period including:</p> <p>2.2 50 private sector actors (such as travel agencies, art houses, fashion brands, and civil society organizations) will provide sponsorship and/or donate resources to anti-ivory behavioral change campaigns per year during the project period.</p> <p>2.3 10,000,000 people exposed (via foot traffic, attendance at events, etc.) to on-the-ground behavioral change campaigns co-implemented by WCS and corporate partners within project period.</p>	<p>2.1-2.3 Project monitoring reports and evaluations of activities; Media reports and company data (website, press releases, etc.)</p>	<p>1 Chinese consumer behavior can be influenced by other consumers, media, corporate actors and the government.</p> <p>2 Government agencies are open to partnering with WCS on public sensitization campaigns.</p> <p>3 The Chinese government is receptive to demonstrations of public support for greater restrictions on the ivory trade</p>

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of verification	Important Assumptions
<p>Output 3: Economic, social and political justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market are provided to government agencies through influential channels and networks</p>	<p>3.1 Findings of 2 research reports with policy justifications published through top 10 social media platforms/top 100 traditional media each year to stimulate bottom-up influence over government decision makers (Baseline=1 in 2013)</p> <p>3.2 A total of 3 proposals each year calling for restricting the ivory trade are delivered on public proposal channels to the China People’s Political Consultative Conference, in 2015 = 3, 2016 = 3 (Baseline = 2 in 2014).</p> <p>3.3 At least 3 government agencies engage in WCS-led public sensitization campaigns against ivory consumption each year. (Baseline = 0 in 2013).</p>	<p>3.1 Reports on CIC social media monitoring analyses</p> <p>3.2 Project monitoring reports on targeted social medial platforms, traditional media channels and online portals</p> <p>3.3 Research reports and proposals on ivory trade policy submitted</p>	<p>1 Chinese consumer behavior can be influenced by other consumers, media, corporate actors and the government.</p> <p>2 Government agencies are open to partnering with WCS on public sensitization campaigns.</p> <p>3 The Chinese government is receptive to demonstrations of public support for greater restrictions on the ivory trade</p>

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of verification	Important Assumptions
<p>Activities (each activity is numbered according to the output that it will contribute towards, for example 1.1, 1.2 and 1.3 are contributing to Output 1)</p> <p>1.1 Design innovative interactive social media campaigns (e.g. Voices of China) which are tailored for use through portable devices and promote and capture direct public commitment “not to bring ivory home” (a key message “branded” with Voices of China and used across all campaigns).</p> <p>1.2 Transform international media content on the elephant crisis into materials that are accessible to the general Chinese public through the first comprehensive Chinese-language website on elephants and ivory trade (jiudaxiang.org).</p> <p>1.3 Expand social media and traditional media coverage on ivory and elephants through the Wildlife Conservation Media Incubator, a social-media-based network that will provide technical, logistic, and editorial support to journalists covering diverse topics that influence ivory consumption (e.g. fashion, religion, travel).</p> <p>1.4 Promote online campaigns to destroy desirability of ivory through partnerships with online media and platforms (such as mainstream online forums, portals, etc.) that provide free advertising and feature content on elephants and poaching.</p> <p>2.1 Coordinate with private sector entities to publicize their statements to stop ivory consumption through social media and traditional media in order to reach a broad audience.</p> <p>2.2 Partner with leading Chinese travel industry actors such as travel e-commerce websites, airlines, and freight carriers to secure pledges of Chinese travelers and workers in Africa not to buy ivory.</p> <p>2.3 Engage top corporations and strategic industries in the design and implementation of behavioral change campaigns to make ivory undesirable.</p> <p>3.1 Execute long-term campaigns with government agencies that support their efforts to reduce the illegal ivory trade and encourage the Chinese public not to bring ivory home.</p> <p>3.2 Coordinate influential partners to present justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market to government ministries and political advisory bodies based on 1) the economic drivers and costs of the current model of limited legal trade in China; 2) the overall impact on people who work in ivory trade; 3) the potential impact on China’s global image; 4) overall cost-benefit ratio of the ivory trade for local livelihoods, ecosystems, and other issues of human security in key African elephant range states where poaching occurs; and 5) opportunities for more sustainable Chinese investment in Africa.</p> <p>3.3 Deliver up-to-date data on the elephant crisis to sensitize director- and manager-level Chinese government decision makers to the urgent need for policy changes that will limit trade in ivory.</p>			

Annex 3 Standard Measures

In future years it is our intention to develop a series of standard measures in order to collate some of the quantitative measures of activity, input and output of IWT projects. These will not be measures of the impact or effectiveness of IWT projects but will contribute to a longer term dataset for Defra to draw upon. The collection of standard measures data will be important as it will allow us to understand the combined impact of all the UK Government funded Challenge Fund projects. This data will therefore provide useful information for the Defra Secretariat and for Defra Ministers regarding the Challenge Fund.

The standard measures for the IWT Challenge Fund are currently under development and it is therefore not necessary, at present, to complete this Annex. Further information and guidance about the IWT standard measures will follow.

Annex 4 Onwards – supplementary material (optional but encouraged as evidence of project achievement)

Checklist for submission

	Check
Is the report less than 10MB? If so, please email to IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk putting the project number in the subject line.	
Is your report more than 10MB? If so, please discuss with IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk about the best way to deliver the report, putting the project number in the subject line.	
Have you included means of verification? You need not submit every project document, but the main outputs and a selection of the others would strengthen the report.	
Do you have hard copies of material you want to submit with the report? If so, please make this clear in the covering email and ensure all material is marked with the project number.	
Have you involved your partners in preparation of the report and named the main contributors	
Have you completed the Project Expenditure table fully?	
Do not include claim forms or other communications with this report.	